Report on the working of elected representatives in Ward Committees. And DETAILS of civic problems registered with the Municipal Corporation across the Wards in Mumbai.

Narotam Sekhsaria Foundation

Friedrich Naumann FÜR DIE FREIHEIT

Foreword

Sample this: During a period between January 2008 and November 2009, the number of complaints filed under Roads by the citizens of Mumbai stood at 74,801. Bad patches, resurfacing of roads, fallen trees on roads, reinstatement of trenches, potholes were some of the major complaints by the citizens.

During the same period, - hold your breath – the maximum questions asked by elected representatives (corporators) in the ward committee meetings at BMC related to renaming of roads, 258 questions in all during 34 months! The next highest number of questions asked pertained to repair of roads: only 85 Questions during the tenure.

Surely the city has more pressing issues than renaming of roads! During the 463 ward committee meetings held during the period, a total of 227 corporators asked only 1,382 questions. 25 of them did not ask a single question, while 109 of them asked less then 5 questions during the 23 months. And almost one fifth of these questions were related to renaming roads!

I call it an Irony of Civic Governance!

This White Paper is a mine of information that has been painstakingly gathered by Praja.org through the Right to Information Act. Matters related to all civic work in Mumbai is discussed and debated in the 16 ward committees that represent 24 administrative wards of Mumbai. Each of these Wards comprises of approximately 8 -11 lakh citizens. The setting up of Wards Committees is a constitutional obligation in accordance with the Constitution (74th Amendment) Act, 1992. Mumbai is represented by 24 Wards and there are only 16 Ward committees to represents these wards administratively. The fact that Mumbai has only 16 Committees against 24 wards, reduces people's voice in the committee. Therefore the first suggestion to the Administration is to create 24 Ward Committees.

Among many other responsibilities of the ward committees, they have the power to review the funds allotted for the development of a particular ward. They are also authorised to sanction municipal works costing upto Rs. 5 lakh (per activity). The presence of representatives of people's organisations on the Committee is supposed to lead to greater accountability and need- based expenditure. It is expected that ward committee meetings will lead to speedy redressal of common grievances of citizens, related to local and essential municipal services like water supply, drainage, sanitation and storm water disposal.

The other urgent requirement for the civic administration is to reclassify the way complaints are registered. At present many of the burning civic issues are classified under a dubious head like Others or Related sections. What it does is to sidestep the significance of an issue. Praja has offered its help in the reclassification of complaints so that relevant complaints are filed under appropriate heads. This will not only ensure accountability, it will also be the transparent. More importantly, it will help our elected representatives perform their responsibilities more diligently and effectively. The Corporation has assured Praja that it will consider and try its best to adopt the suggestions made by Praja.org.

The White Paper provides many such relevant issues facing the governance of this city. The purpose of such papers is not to point fingers at anyone; It is to galvanise our elected representatives and the citizens to get pro-active in fulfilling their responsibilities towards better governance. It is as much up to the citizens to ask the right questions to their elected representatives who in turn can present the citizen's grievances to the right forum at the civic body. Praja.org is aimed to bring about just such an active interaction among, the citizen, elected representatives and the administration of the civic body.

Nitai Mehta, Managing Trustee



Mumbai Ward Constituency Map

CONTENT

- A. CIVIC PROBLEMS ACROSS MUMBAI.
 - 1. Graph1: Top five civic problems across the wards in Mumbai.
 - 2. Graph2: Top five problems received by the wards on Roads in Mumbai.
 - 3. Graph 3: Top five problems received by the wards on Licensing in Mumbai.
 - 4. Graph 4: Top five complaints received by the wards on Water in Mumbai.
 - 5. Graph 5: Top five complaints received by the wards on Drainage in Mumbai.
 - 6. Graph 6: Top five problems received by the wards on Solid Waste Management in Mumbai.
 - 7. Graph 7: Number of related/other complaint registered in the top five civic problems in Mumbai.
- B. WORKING OF WARD COMMITTEES.
 - 1. Scope and Working of Ward Committees.
 - 2. Graph 8: Ward Committee details at glance.
 - 3. Graph 9: Number of Question asked on a particular Civic issue.
- C. DETAILS OF R SOUTH WARD COMMITTEE MEETING.
 - 1. Graph 10: Attendance of Corporators in R South Ward Committee meetings.
 - 2. Graph 11: Number of Question asked on Civic issue in R South Ward Committee meetings.
 - 3. Graph 12: Number of Question asked by Corporators of R South Ward.
 - 4. Graph 13: Number of Complaints filed in R South ward on civic issues.



Graph 1: Top five civic problems across the wards in Mumbai.

The above data presents the number of civic complaints filed across the wards in The Municipal Corporation of Greater Mumbai during the period of January 2008 to November 2009. The entire data has been acquired under Right to Information Act over the last two years.

The chart gives exact number of complaints filed under Roads (74801), License (54062), Water Supply (52501), Drainage (33973) and Storm Waste Management (26726).



Graph 2: Top five problems received by the wards on Roads in Mumbai.

The above chart represents the number of Complaints filed under the Road Department. Interestingly the highest number of Complaints is being classified as road related/others.

The chart gives exact number of complaints filed under Bad Patches (3154), Resurfacing of Road (1807), Fallen Tree on road (1079) and Reinstatement of trenches (659).



Graph 3: Top five problems received by the wards on Licensing in Mumbai.

The above chart represents the number of Complaints filed under the License Department. Interestingly the highest number of Complaint is filed in the related section of License related/other and MOH related/other issues. MOH: Medical Officer of Health, the complaints received under this head are unauthorized food selling or preparations, unauthorized floor mills etc.

The chart gives exact number of complaints filed under Unauthorized Stalls (5000) on Footpaths/Roads (2397), Hawkers and Unauthorized banner and advertisement (1462).



Graph 4: Top five complaints received by the wards on Water in Mumbai.

The above chart represents the number of Complaints filed under the Water Department. Interestingly the highest number of Complaint is filed in the Water related issues/ others.

The chart gives exact number of complaints filed under Water Supply, Shortage of Water (13115), Leaks in Water Lines (3824), Contaminated Water (2890) and Unauthorized Water connections (1841).



Graph 5: Top five complaints received by the wards on Drainage in Mumbai.

The above chart represents the number of Complaints filed under the Drainage Department. Interestingly the second number of Complaint is filed in the related section of Drainage related/other.

The chart gives exact number of complaints filed under Drainage and Blockages (15111), Overflowing drains and manholes (6699), Cleaning of Septic Tanks (1945) and Replacement of damage/missing manholes (1894).



Graph 6: Top five problems received by the wards on Solid Waste Management in Mumbai.

The above chart represents the number of Complaints filed under the Solid Waste Complaint Department. Interestingly the highest number of Complaint is filed in the related/others section of Solid Waste Management.

The chart gives exact number of complaints filed under Garbage not lifted from House/Gully (3300), Collection Points (2856), Removal of Debris (1753) and Sweeping of Roads (675).



Graph 7: Number of related/other complaint registered in the top five civic problems in Mumbai.

The above graphs presents the number of complaints filed in the RELATED/OTHERS compliant type in each of the top five complaints received in the wards across Mumbai.

The total number of complaints received in the issue of Roads is 74801 out of which 66446 (88%) are complaints received in other/related complaint type according to the Road Department. Similarly License received 54062 total complaints and 21057 (39%) in others, Water Supply received 52501 total complaints and 28822 (55%) in others, Drainage received 33973 total complaints and 7332 (21%) in others and Solid Waste Management received 26726 total complaints and 14580 (54%) in others.

SCOPE AND WORKING OF WARD COMMITTEE

WARD COMMITTEES IN MUMBAI

- a) 24 administrative Wards in Mumbai.
- b) Effectively there are only 16 Ward Committees to represent these 24 wards.
- c) Each of these Wards comprises of approximately 8 -11 lakh citizens.
- d) The Wards Committees were formed in 2000 in MCGM.

WARDS COMMITTEES ACTS/ RULES

The setting up of Wards Committees is a constitutional obligation in accordance with the Constitution (74th Amendment) Act, 1992. The task of constituting the Wards Committees has been delegated to the concerned Corporation. Wards Committee shall consist of corporators representing the electoral wards, the Ward Officer and maximum three members belonging to NGOs and CBOs engaged in social welfare activities in the area of a Wards Committee.

DUTIES OF MCGM/WARD COMMITTEES (MAHARASHTRA; BOMBAY ACT NO. III OF 1888) CAN BE GROUPED INTO FOUR OR FIVE CATEGORIES LIKE:

A) Public Health B) Medical Relief C) Public Works D) Education and development.

FUNCTIONS OF WARDS COMMITTEES

- e) The Wards Committees have the power to review the funds allotted for the development of a particular ward.
- f) They are also authorised to sanction municipal works costing upto Rs. 5 lakh (per activity).
- g) The presence of representatives of people's organisations on the Committee could lead to greater accountability and need- based expenditure.
- h) Speedy redressal of common grievances of citizens.
- i) Connected with local and essential municipal services like water supply, drainage, sanitation and storm water disposal.
- j) To consider and make recommendations on the proposals regarding estimates of expenditure pertaining to the wards under different budgetary heads of account before being forwarded to the Commissioner.
- k) To grant administrative approval and financial sanction to the plans for municipal works to be carried out within the territorial area of the Wards Committees costing up to Rs 5 lakh per activity, provided that specific provision therefore is available in the sanctioned budget.

CONDUCT OF BUSINESS

- A) Works to be executed by meeting the cost thereof from the lump sum provision for unforeseen works in each Corporator's Constituency (Corporator's fund) and works to be executed under Budgetary Provisions.
- B) Suggestions / Proposals related to
 - Maintenance of cleanliness.
 - Repair of markets.
 - Repair of roads.
 - Repair of school buildings and other municipal buildings.
 - Development and maintenance of gardens.
 - Vermiculture Schemes.
 - Municipal Dispensaries and Hospitals.
 - Beautification of roads
 - Footpaths.
- C) Suggestions relating to naming and renaming of roads and chowks.

16 WARD COMMITTEES IN MUMBAI

- 1. A B and E: Colaba, JJ Hospital, Umarkharik, Mazgoan and Nagpada.
- 2. C and D: Khetwadi, MumbaDevi, Opera House and Malbar Hill.
- 3. F/S and F/N: Mazgaon, Parel, Matunga, and Dharavi (SC)
- 4. G/S: Worli, Shiwadi and Dadar.
- 5. G/N: Dadar West, Mahim, Dharavi (SC)
- 6. H/E and H/W: Khar, Bandra and Santacruz.
- 7. K/E: Vileparle, Jogeshwari East and Andheri East.
- 8. K/W: Versova, Vileparle West, Jogeshwari West and Andheri West.
- 9. P/S: Film City, Goregaon East and West.
- 10. P/N: Malad West, Khandivali East, Marve and Erangal.
- 11. R/S: Sanjay Gandhi Park, Essel World, Borivali and Khandivali.
- 12. R/C and R/N: Dhaiser East and West, Borivali West.
- 13. M/E and M/W: Chembur, Trombay, Shastri nagar and Govandi.
- 14. S and T: Mulund, Bhandup, Tulsi Lake, Thane east and west.
- 15. L: Kurla and Nehru Nagar
- 16. N: Kurla and Ghatkopar

Graph 8: Ward Committee details at glance.

Total number of Corporators	227
Total Number of Meetings	463
Total number of Questions asked	1382
Average number of Questions asked in	
Ward Meetings	3



Graph 8a: Total Number of Questions asked by Corporators in Ward Committee meetings.

The above chart presents the number of question asked by Corporators in 16 Ward Committee meeting in the last two years (January 2008 to November 2009).

The above chart shows that 25 Corporators has never asked a single question and 109 Corporators raised one to five questions in last twenty three months. 57 Corporators raised questions between six to ten numbers and eleven to fifteen questions were raised by 20 Corporators. Only 16 Corporators asked the maximum number of question that is sixteen to thirty six.



Graph 9: Number of Question asked on a particular Civic issue.

The above chart represents the details of issues asked in questions of the Corporator in the Ward Committee meetings. The highest number of questions is asked on Renaming of Roads that is 258 Questions. The important concerns of the citizens like Repairs of roads (85 Qns), Unauthorized Construction (80 Qns), Shortage of Water Supply (65 Qns) and others got less importance in questions.

According to the type of issues asked in the question renaming of road is the highest across all the ward committee, whereas the focus or the need of the hour is to address day to day issues of the citizens.

R South WARD COMMITTEE

Total	meeting	number	of	meeting	
(Janua	ry 2008 to 2	November	2009).	29
Total number of questions asked.					50
Total number of Corporator in the ward.					11

Graph 10: Attendance of Corporators in the R South Ward Committee meetings.



The above data shows details of attendance of Corporators in the Ward Committee meeting held during January 2008 to November 2009. A total of 29 meeting were held in the said period and attended by 11 Corporators.

The above graph shows that Thakur Ramesh Singh Corporator from Dampuda has attended only one meeting out 29 meeting held.



Graph 11: Number of Question asked on Civic issue in R South Ward Committee meetings.

The above data shows details of the questions raised by the Corporator in the R/S Ward Committee meeting held during January 2008 to November 2009. A total of 50 questions were asked in the said period.

The above graph show that out 50 questions asked 13 were asked on renaming of road. Subsequently only six question were asked on license issues and 5 Questions on toilet issues for the R South ward.



Graph 12: Number of Question asked by Corporators of R South Ward.

The above data shows details of number of questions asked by the Corporators in the R South Ward Committee meeting held during January 2008 to November 2009. A total of 50 questions were asked in the said period by Corporators.

The above graph shows that only two corporators had asked ten or more than ten questions. Whereas one corporators didn't asked a single question and others have raised seven or less than seven questions.





The above data shows the number of complaints filed by the citizens in the ward R/S over the period of January 2008 to November 2009. A total of 3851 number of complaints were filed on different issues across the Ward.

The highest number of complaints was registered under the complaint head of Water Supply that is around 1043 number of complaints. The top five complaints constitute Drainage 679, Garden 475, Roads 420 and License 324.